



302 North 1st Avenue, Suite 300 ▲ Phoenix, Arizona 85003  
Phone (602) 254-6300 ▲ FAX (602) 254-6490  
E-mail: mag@mag.maricopa.gov ▲ Web site: www.mag.maricopa.gov

December 4, 2008

TO: Members of the MAG Air Quality Technical Advisory Committee

FROM: John Kross, Queen Creek, Chair

SUBJECT: MEETING NOTIFICATION AND TRANSMITTAL OF TENTATIVE AGENDA

Thursday, December 11, 2008 - 1:30 p.m.  
MAG Office, Suite 200 - Saguaro Room  
302 North 1<sup>st</sup> Avenue, Phoenix

Please park in the garage underneath the building. Bring your ticket to the meeting; parking will be validated. For those using transit, the Regional Public Transportation Authority will provide transit tickets for your trip. For those using bicycles, please lock your bicycle in the bike rack in the garage.

Pursuant to Title II of the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA), MAG does not discriminate on the basis of disability in admissions to or participation in its public meetings. Persons with a disability may request a reasonable accommodation, such as a sign language interpreter, by contacting Jason Stephens at the MAG office. Requests should be made as early as possible to allow time to arrange the accommodation.

Members of the MAG Air Quality Technical Advisory Committee may attend in person, via video conference or by telephone conference call. Those attending by video conference must notify the MAG site three business days prior to the meeting.

Please be advised that under procedures approved by the MAG Regional Council, all MAG committees need to have a quorum to conduct the meeting. A quorum is a simple majority of the membership. If you are unable to attend the meeting, please make arrangements for a proxy from your entity to represent you.

A Voluntary Association of Local Governments in Maricopa County

City of Apache Junction ▲ City of Avondale ▲ Town of Buckeye ▲ Town of Carefree ▲ Town of Cave Creek ▲ City of Chandler ▲ City of El Mirage ▲ Fort McDowell Yavapai Nation ▲ Town of Fountain Hills ▲ Town of Gila Bend  
Gila River Indian Community ▲ Town of Gilbert ▲ City of Glendale ▲ City of Goodyear ▲ Town of Guadalupe ▲ City of Litchfield Park ▲ Maricopa County ▲ City of Mesa ▲ Town of Paradise Valley ▲ City of Peoria ▲ City of Phoenix  
Town of Queen Creek ▲ Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community ▲ City of Scottsdale ▲ City of Surprise ▲ City of Tempe ▲ City of Tolleson ▲ Town of Wickenburg ▲ Town of Youngtown ▲ Arizona Department of Transportation

## TENTATIVE AGENDA

### COMMITTEE ACTION REQUESTED

1. Call to Order

2. Call to the Audience

An opportunity will be provided to members of the public to address the Air Quality Technical Advisory Committee on items not scheduled on the agenda that fall under the jurisdiction of MAG, or on items on the agenda for discussion but not for action. Members of the public will be requested not to exceed a three minute time period for their comments. A total of 15 minutes will be provided for the Call to the Audience agenda item, unless the Air Quality Technical Advisory Committee requests an exception to this limit. Please note that those wishing to comment on action agenda items will be given an opportunity at the time the item is heard.

3. Approval of the September 25, 2008 Meeting Minutes

4. Evaluation of Proposed PM-10 Paving Unpaved Road Projects for FY 2011 and FY 2012 CMAQ Funding

An evaluation of proposed PM-10 Paving Unpaved Road Projects for Federal Fiscal Year 2011 and 2012 Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality Improvement Funds has been conducted. The deadline for submitting the projects was September 19, 2008.

The FY 2008-2012 MAG Transportation Improvement Program identifies \$3,658,362 million for FY 2011 and \$5,004,000 million for FY 2012 in CMAQ funding for Paving Unpaved Road Projects. It is requested that the Paving Unpaved Road Projects be ranked and forwarded to the Transportation Review Committee. Please refer to the enclosed material.

2. For information.

3. Review and approve the September 25, 2008 meeting minutes.

5. For information, discussion and recommendation to rank the Proposed PM-10 Paving Unpaved Road Projects for FY 2011 and FY 2012 CMAQ funding and forward to the MAG Transportation Review Committee.

5. Evaluation of Proposed PM-10 Certified Street Sweeper Projects for FY 2009 CMAQ Funding

An evaluation of proposed PM-10 Certified Street Sweeper Projects for Federal Fiscal Year 2009 Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality Improvement (CMAQ) Funds has been conducted. The deadline for submitting the projects was September 19, 2008.

The FY 2009 Unified Planning Work Program and FY 2008-2012 MAG Transportation Improvement Program contain \$1,210,000 in FY 2009 CMAQ funding to encourage the purchase and utilization of PM-10 certified street sweepers. A minimum local match of 5.7 percent is required.

Fifteen projects requesting federal funds were evaluated. The MAG Air Quality Technical Advisory Committee is requested to recommend a prioritized list of proposed PM-10 Certified Street Sweeper Projects for FY 2009 CMAQ funding to the MAG Management Committee. Please refer to the enclosed material.

6. Gila River Indian Community Air Quality Management Plan

A presentation will be given on the Gila River Indian Community (GRIC) Air Quality Management Plan. The presentation will include a discussion of background on the GRIC; types of air pollution sources; Tribal Implementation Plan elements; fugitive dust issues/ordinance/earthmoving permit and dust control plan; and next step/permitting.

7. Draft MAG Eight-Hour Ozone Redesignation Request and Maintenance Plan

The Draft MAG Eight-Hour Ozone Resignation Request and Maintenance Plan is designed to demonstrate maintenance of the eight-hour ozone standard of 0.08 parts per million promulgated by the Environmental

5. For information, discussion and recommendation of a prioritized list of proposed PM-10 Certified Street Sweeper Projects for FY 2009 CMAQ funding and to retain the prioritized list for any additional FY 2009 CMAQ funds that may become available due to year-end closeout, including any redistributed obligation authority, or additional funding received by this region.

6. For information and discussion.

7. For information and discussion.

Protection Agency in 1997. No violations of this eight-hour ozone standard have occurred since 2004. The air quality modeling in the plan demonstrates maintenance of the standard through 2025 with existing measures in place. With the submittal of the redesignation request and maintenance plan, the Maricopa nonattainment area will have satisfied all of the requirements for redesignation to attainment for this eight-hour ozone standard. A presentation will be provided.

8. Tentative 2009 Meeting Schedule for the MAG Air Quality Technical Advisory Committee

For your information and convenience, the Tentative Meeting Schedule for the MAG Air Quality Technical Advisory Committee for January-December 2009 is provided. Please refer to the enclosed material.

9. Call for Future Agenda Items

The next meeting of the Committee has been tentatively scheduled for Thursday, January 29, 2009 at 1:30 p.m. The Chairman will invite the Committee members to suggest future agenda items.

8. For information and discussion.

9. For information and discussion.

MINUTES OF THE  
MARICOPA ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS  
AIR QUALITY TECHNICAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE MEETING

Thursday, September 25, 2008  
MAG Office  
Phoenix, Arizona

MEMBERS PRESENT

John Kross, Town of Queen Creek, Chairman  
#Shirley Gunther for David Fitzhugh, Avondale  
Lucky Roberts, Buckeye  
#Jim Weiss, Chandler  
#Jamie McCullough, El Mirage  
\*Tami Ryall, Gilbert  
Doug Kukino, Glendale  
James Nichols, Goodyear  
Scott Bouchie, Mesa  
\*Gaye Knight, Phoenix  
#Larry Person, Scottsdale  
Antonio DeLaCruz, Surprise  
Oddvar Tveit, Tempe  
#Mark Hannah, Youngtown  
\*Walter Bouchard, Citizen Representative  
\*Corey Woods, American Lung Association of Arizona  
#Sam Villalobos for Barbara Sprungl, Salt River Project  
Brian O'Donnell, Southwest Gas Corporation  
Mark Hajduk, Arizona Public Service Company  
\*Gina Grey, Western States Petroleum Association  
\*Randi Alcott, Valley Metro  
\*Dave Berry, Arizona Motor Transport Association  
Jeannette Fish, Maricopa County Farm Bureau  
Steve Trussell for Russell Bowers, Arizona Rock  
Products Association  
\*Michelle Rill, Greater Phoenix Chamber of Commerce

\*Members neither present nor represented by proxy.  
#Participated via telephone conference call.  
+Participated via video conference call.

OTHERS PRESENT

Lindy Bauer, Maricopa Association of Governments  
Julie Hoffman, Maricopa Association of Governments  
Patrisia Magallon, Maricopa Association of  
Governments  
Cathy Arthur, Maricopa Association of Governments  
Dean Giles, Maricopa Association of Governments  
Randy Sedlacek, Maricopa Association of Governments  
Steve Peplau, Arizona Department of Environmental  
Quality  
Jeff Paige, Rummel Construction Inc  
Joonwon Joo, Arizona Department of Transportation

Amanda McGennis, Associated General  
Contractors  
Spencer Kamps, Homebuilders Association of  
Central Arizona  
Mannie Carpenter, Valley Forward  
\*Kai Umeda, University of Arizona Cooperative  
Extension  
Beverly Chenausky, Arizona Department of  
Transportation  
Diane Arnst, Arizona Department of  
Environmental Quality  
#Wienke Tax, Environmental Protection Agency  
Jo Crumbaker, Maricopa County Air Quality  
Department  
Duane Yantorno, Arizona Department of  
Weights and Measures  
Ed Stillings, Federal Highway Administration  
\*Judi Nelson, Arizona State University  
Christopher Horan Salt River Pima-Maricopa  
Indian Community  
\*David Rueckert, Citizen Representative

Joe Pampinella, CNS Management  
Jane McVay, Arizona Department of Transportation  
Michelle Wilson, City of Glendale  
Ramona Simpson, Town of Queen Creek  
Heather Hodgman, City of Apache Junction  
Scott DiBiase, Pinal County  
Russell VanLeuven, Arizona Department of  
Agriculture  
David Johnson, Town of Buckeye  
Christine Nunez, City of Surprise

1. Call to Order

A meeting of the MAG Air Quality Technical Advisory Committee was conducted on September 25, 2008. John Kross, Town of Queen Creek, Chair, called the meeting to order at approximately 1:36 p.m. Jamie McCullough, City of El Mirage; Jim Weiss, City of Chandler; Shirley Gunther, City of Avondale; Larry Person, City of Scottsdale; and Wienke Tax, Environmental Protection Agency attended the meeting via telephone conference call.

2. Call to the Audience

Mr. Kross stated that, according to the MAG public comment process, members of the audience who wish to speak are requested to fill out comment cards, which are available on the tables adjacent to the doorways inside the meeting room. Citizens are asked not to exceed a three minute time period for their comments. Public comment is provided at the beginning of the meeting for nonagenda items and nonaction agenda items. He noted that no public comment cards had been received.

3. Approval of the May 27, 2008 Meeting Minutes

The Committee reviewed the minutes from the May 27, 2008 meeting. Doug Kukino, City of Glendale, moved and Scott Bouchie, City of Mesa, seconded and the motion to approve the May 27, 2008 meeting minutes carried unanimously.

4. Update on the Status of the MAG 2007 Five Percent Plan for PM-10

Lindy Bauer, Maricopa Association of Governments (MAG), provided an update on the status of the MAG 2007 Five Percent Plan for PM-10. She stated that on June 30, 2008 the plan was deemed to be complete by the Environmental Protection Agency (EPA). Ms. Bauer added that according to the Clean Air Act, EPA has twelve months from the completeness finding to take action on the Plan. She indicated that its anticipated that EPA will take action on the Plan by June 30, 2009. Ms. Bauer mentioned that the region needs to have three years of clean data at the monitors. She commented that the Committee will be provided with an update on the monitor data. Ms. Bauer stated that 2008 needs to be the first year of clean data. She added that the Arizona Department of Environmental Quality (ADEQ) has collected the ordinances that were mandated by Senate Bill 1552 and submitted them to EPA. Ms. Bauer indicated that the focus now would be on implementation of the measures and staying clean at the monitors.

Mark Hajduk, Arizona Public Service Company, inquired if the ordinances were public record and requested a copy of the ordinances. Ms. Bauer responded yes and mentioned that ADEQ has provided MAG with a complete copy of the ordinances. She added that MAG will provide a copy to Mr. Hajduk. Wienke Tax, EPA requested that Larry Person, City of Scottsdale inform the Committee what was discussed between them. Mr. Person indicated that several communities may have an interest in tweaking some of the ordinances since a short time frame was provided to add ordinances to the Plan. He stated that he discussed with Ms. Tax and Colleen McKaughan, EPA, their position toward having the cities submit possible amendments to the ordinances that have been submitted as a supplement to the Plan. Mr. Person added that the consensus was that EPA will entertain amendments to ordinances; however, the preference would be for a process to be set by all cities who are considering changes to submit amendments at the same time frame as the package to EPA to supplement the Plan. Ms. Tax mentioned that it would be too complicated and confusing to have the ordinances come in piece meal rather than in a package.

Mr. Kross inquired if any other cities are considering amendments. Oddvar Tveit, City of Tempe stated that the City is performing enforcement and delegation. Mr. Kross asked if it was in the implementation stage. Mr. Tveit responded yes. Jo Crumbaker, Maricopa County Air Quality Department stated that the County is making changes to the penalty portion of the ordinances. She added that the Justices of the Peace have requested additional flexibility. Ms. Crumbaker mentioned the parking ordinances on vacant lots and indicated that the County is decriminalizing the ordinance. She commented that the ordinance will have civil penalties in a scaled manner. Ms. Crumbaker stated that the County is adding scaled components to the off-highway vehicle ordinance. She mentioned that a number of cities have expressed interest in doing something similar. Ms. Crumbaker added that the cities have either copied the County or Senate Bill 1552 and their judges have the same perspective as the Justices of the Peace have that the County is dealing with. She indicated that the County is making those changes and they were emailed on Tuesday.

Ms. Bauer inquired if Mr. Hadjuk would still like a copy of what has been submitted. Mr. Hajduk responded yes and voiced his concerns on the ordinances that did not address easements and utility vehicles driving on easements during work periods which were addressed in Senate Bill 1552. He mentioned his uncertainty whether a public comment process is in place when the ordinances are drafted. Mr. Hadjuk added that he would like the ordinances to go through them and make sure that employees know what is expected of them when working in each city. He stated that he would like to know when there is an opportunity to amend an ordinance and be able to express his concerns with that city.

5. Update on the Air Quality Monitoring Data

Julie Hoffman, MAG, stated that the air quality monitoring data for 2008 indicates that there have been exceedances of the eight-hour ozone standard and the PM-10 standard in the region. She added that these exceedances have been compiled and provided to committee members at their places. Ms. Hoffman indicated that for ozone, the table shows the 2008 exceedances of the revised eight-hour ozone standard of .075 parts per million based on preliminary data available through September 23, 2008. She mentioned that the table indicates that the monitors that have exceeded the eight-hour ozone standard for this year. Ms. Hoffman added that the list of those exceedances for each monitor are listed in order of the daily maximum concentration. She mentioned that the monitoring sites that have a 4<sup>th</sup> high value greater than the standard are shown in bold on the table that was provided. She stated that there are 19 sites in the nonattainment area that monitor ozone. Ms. Hoffman added that the standard is calculated by taking the three year average of the 4<sup>th</sup> highest ozone concentration at each monitor. She commented that when comparing the three year periods, eleven of the 19 monitors have had their three year average for the current period of 2006, 2007 and 2008 decrease from the previous three year period of 2005, 2006, and 2007. Ms. Hoffman indicated that the concentration values are decreasing. Ms. Hoffman mentioned that an additional five monitors have had no change in the three year period and three have had an increase in their three year average.

Brian O'Donnell, Southwest Gas Corporation, stated that the Arizona Chamber of Commerce submitted a letter to EPA requesting that the implementation be delayed. He inquired if information was received from EPA to determine an implementation date. Ms. Tax replied that EPA has been sued not only by the Arizona Chamber of Commerce but by other environmental groups. She stated that they did not request a stay of the standards, therefore, EPA will continue to implement them until they are told otherwise.

Ms. Hoffman stated that a table has been provided for PM-10 which shows the exceedances that the region experienced in 2008. She added that there is a total of 10 exceedances. Ms. Hoffman indicated that the exceedances occurred on eight different dates at three different monitoring sites. She commented that the West 43<sup>rd</sup> Avenue monitor experienced five exceedances in 2008, four were at the Buckeye monitor and one at the Coyote Lakes monitor. Ms. Hoffman mentioned that ADEQ has been evaluating the exceedances to determine if they qualify as exceptional events. She stated that ADEQ will discuss the process and provide an update in the next agenda item.

Steve Trussell, Arizona Rock Products, inquired if Coyote Lakes was an official monitor. Ms. Crumbaker stated that the monitor was official in April. She added that she could remember the month but was uncertain of the year. Ms. Crumbaker commented that the perspective of EPA is that if the data exists than it will count as a monitor. She mentioned that the monitor does meet monitoring objectives so that it could be identified as part of the network. Mr. Trussell stated that his understanding was that the monitor was not set up according to EPA guidelines. Ms. Crumbaker responded that she did not know the answer to the question but would find out and let Mr. Trussell know.

6. Update on Air Quality Monitored Data Influenced by Exceptional Events

Steve Peplau, Arizona Department of Environmental Quality, stated that a handout was provided which presented the type of submissions produced for each individual day. He added that it has been difficult getting the events dating back to 2006. Mr. Peplau noted that the policy changed in early 2007. He commented that ADEQ has been working on 2008 and has been modifying the submissions to provide the additional information requested by EPA in support of an exceptional event. Mr. Peplau indicated that ADEQ submitted a large batch of exceptional events for consideration by EPA on September 16, 2008. He mentioned that a copy of the letter sent to Deborah Jordan, EPA, has been provided. Mr. Peplau added that the letter included the final submittal after the stakeholder process as well as the comment period from the public on final submissions. He provided the listing which included ten areas in Maricopa County, Yuma and Nogales. Mr. Peplau stated that EPA has 60 days to provide concurrence on the listing. He added that the data has been flagged in the EPA database; however, EPA has to concur in order for the data not to be used in a compliance calculation. Mr. Peplau indicated that they may not likely get a concurrence from EPA in 60 days. He commented on the possibility of an extension for the concurrence by EPA since it was a substantial package. Mr. Peplau mentioned that staff has been working on the package for months and gathering information such as the rear trajectory analysis and photos of the time that the event occurred. He stated that EPA requires that each event is matched with the 95 percentile of the region levels over the last five years. Mr. Peplau added that each event has to be compared against the percentile which is also listed on the pages that ADEQ submitted for an event. He commented that ADEQ's workload was the reason the package was submitted on September 16, 2008. Mr. Peplau provided the list of dates ADEQ is evaluating in 2008. He added that ADEQ is compiling data such as pictures, readings from the various sites, weather data and weather maps.

Mr. Peplau stated that ADEQ has ten candidate locations and seven dates that are being researched. He added that two events occurred on July 19, 2007. Mr. Peplau indicated that one event can be explained since there were some storm fronts and high winds that occurred; however, the event in Buckeye cannot be explained. He noted that ADEQ may not be able to explain every event that occurs. Mr. Peplau commented that the Buckeye monitor scored a high level at a different time than

several other monitors in the region in another event. He mentioned that multiple events can occur in the region. Mr. Peplau stated that the Buckeye monitor went off around three in the morning and had actual wind speeds in the range of two to four miles per hour which normally does not create a wind event. He indicated that ADEQ is perplexed over the event and will certainly be on the look out for any other explanation. Mr. Peplau mentioned that everyone needs to do their part in order to avoid a situation in which an unexplained event can happen.

Ms. Arnst inquired about the historical frequency box. Mr. Peplau responded that ADEQ has been reviewing five years of data. He added that they compare where the region was historically and what the weather was like at that moment. Mr. Peplau indicated that when an event occurs, ADEQ can show that it was well above what the region historically had for PM concentrations. He mentioned that the box contained data comparing the various monitors by site. Mr. Peplau mentioned that ADEQ is comparing the monitors that went off with the year and the seasonality.

Mr. Kross inquired about the length of time that EPA will take to make a determination on exceptional event reports. Mr. Peplau stated that ADEQ is required to flag the data within six months. He stated that ADEQ has two years to submit the data to EPA. Mr. Peplau added that EPA has 60 days to respond and they can ask for an extension if necessary. He mentioned that ADEQ was behind in getting the events written up since the policy has changed. Mr. Peplau commented on the workload that ADEQ staff has experienced. He stated that there will be an announcement for a stakeholder meeting to go over the 2008 events. Mr. Peplau added that ADEQ is currently working on those events and trying to get them in final form in order to satisfy the state stakeholder requirement as well as the federal comment period requirement. He noted that EPA requires that ADEQ provide the public with the final document for comment.

Mr. Kross inquired if there should be any concern with respect to the time it takes for preparation of the events and response from EPA relative to findings. Ms. Bauer responded that timing is not exactly perfect. She added that if there is a possibility that the region will not have three years of clean data, the Committee will need to know since the Clean Air Act will require that another year of five percent reductions of PM-10 emissions be added to the plan until the standard is attained. Ms. Bauer noted that exceptional events process seems to be a long process. She mentioned that ADEQ has been reporting the data early as well as reporting days that may be flagged. Ms. Bauer commented the ADEQ will notify MAG if there is a day that has an event with no explanation. Mr. Peplau stated that waiting for a concurrence will delay the ultimate determination of whether that day is not to be used for compliance determination. He added that if there is no response from EPA, the region may not know if they are in compliance with the plan. Mr. Peplau indicated that there is no guarantee that EPA will accept ADEQ's explanation for an event. He commented that ADEQ has not gone through enough of the events to have a historical feel for the criteria that may be acceptable to EPA. Mr. Peplau mentioned that ADEQ feels that the event days were very high windy days. He noted that the region receives 60 to 70 miles per hour winds. Ms. Bauer stated that when the region began to exceed the standard in November 2005, the region did not wait for EPA to notify MAG that a violation occurred and that a plan will be needed. She requested that EPA stay on track to evaluate the exceptional events in the region. Mr. Peplau mentioned that ADEQ will also be following up with EPA.

Spencer Kamps, Homebuilders Association of Central Arizona, inquired if there are 10 events to date in the year 2008. Mr. Peplau responded yes. Mr. Kamps inquired if the events have been flagged.

Mr. Peplau replied that all of the events have been flagged in the database and are in the process of being written up. He added that a comment field has been added to the database on the beliefs of what might have caused the event to occur. Mr. Peplau commented on the possibilities which may cause an event to occur. He mentioned that EPA has been sued for the policy. Mr. Peplau indicated that ADEQ is awaiting the decision from the court on the policy. Mr. Kross inquired if Mr. Peplau was referring to the exceptional event policy. Mr. Peplau responded yes. Mr. Kamps asked if ADEQ was compiling the data and sending it forward. Mr. Peplau responded yes and stated that the packaging is similar to the one provided to the Committee. He added that the package provided is a template of what ADEQ will be using for submissions. Mr. Peplau mentioned that ADEQ is pulling the information together and should have the final done in a month. Mr. Kamps inquired if the events will be packaged together. Mr. Peplau responded yes. Mr. Kamps asked if three exceedances are allowed over three years. Ms. Bauer responded that no more than three exceedances per monitor are allowed over a three year period. Mr. Kamps inquired about the time frame after submittal for EPA to review. Mr. Peplau responded that the timing is unknown since EPA staff is reviewing events from five to six states and are trying to be consistent amongst the states in their response. Mr. Kamps inquired if the Buckeye monitor was official. Ms. Crumbaker responded that the monitor is not in the PM-10 nonattainment area; however, it is an official monitor.

7. Update on CMAQ Projects for the Federal Fiscal Year 2008 Interim Year End Closeout

Dean Giles, MAG, provided an update on Congestion Mitigation Air Quality (CMAQ) projects for the Federal Fiscal Year 2008 Interim Year End Closeout. He stated that the Committee made a recommendation on May 27, 2008 to forward the evaluation of the proposed CMAQ projects to the TRC for use in prioritizing them. He added that an approximate \$4.7 million was available for project funding in the interim closeout. Mr. Giles mentioned that the Committee also made a recommendation to forward one air quality project which contained the remaining 12 street sweeper projects from Fiscal Year 2008. He indicated that the TRC made a recommendation to advance additional funding to 18 projects during the closeout. Mr. Giles stated that the Management Committee concurred with the recommendation. He added that three projects in addition to the 18 projects were placed on a contingency list. Mr. Giles mentioned that the MAG Regional Council took final action in July 2008 on the final closeout. He indicated that the two projects with the highest PM-10 reductions which were the PM-10 certified street sweepers and the metro light rail project were provided with additional funding.

Beverly Chenausky, Arizona Department of Transportation (ADOT), inquired if letters were sent out about the purchasing of the street sweepers by the Regional Council. Mr. Giles responded that MAG received a notification from ADOT for the funding for 12 street sweepers in September. He added that the local agencies on the remaining list have been provided with letters indicating that they can proceed with the procurement of sweepers. Mr. Kamps inquired if additional CMAQ money is available to focus on street sweeping around the areas that are flagged in the region. Ms. Bauer responded that MAG will be going through the process. She added that projects were due to MAG on September 19, 2008. Ms. Bauer mentioned that MAG will be following the new draft principles for federal funding that were developed by the stakeholder's group. She commented that the street sweepers and the unpaved road projects are pilot tests of the new draft process. Ms. Bauer indicated that they will be coming to the December 11, 2008 Air Quality Technical Advisory Committee meeting. Mr. Giles stated that MAG has received an overwhelming response from local agencies for paving unpaved roads and street sweepers for more funding than is available.

8. Call for Future Agenda Items

Mr. Kross requested that an update be given from Maricopa County on the status of their enforcement program. Ms. Crumbaker stated that she will be happy to coordinate the update. She indicated that they have a new Maricopa County Air Quality Department Director. Ms. Bauer stated that Ms. Arnst had indicated at the May 27, 2008 meeting that the agenda and materials were not received at ADEQ and she had to download the information from the website. Ms. Bauer added that MAG would like the record to reflect that MAG staff contacted Ms. Arnst and confirmed the address in the MAG mail list database. She mentioned that Ms. Arnst indicated that the problem was at the ADEQ end. She would like the minutes to reflect that MAG staff had followed through.

Amanda McGennis, Associated General Contractors, requested an update on Rule 310.01 along with Rule 310 to show the efforts being done on the vacant lot program. She also requested information on the status of the ombudsman. Ms. Crumbaker responded that she did not have information on that but will follow up with that request. Ms. Arnst inquired about the Ozone Maintenance Plan. Ms. Bauer responded that MAG will be reporting on the Plan at the December 11, 2008 meeting. She added that MAG is currently working on the modeling and has just received the County 2005 Periodic Emissions Inventory. Ms. Tax requested to have a presentation on the Gila River Tribal Implementation Plan. Ms. Bauer replied that MAG has continuously followed up with the Gila River Indian Community. She added that Dan Blair has indicated that he talked to Ms. Tax and explained the reason why the Gila River Indian Community was uncomfortable to provide a presentation. Ms. Tax stated that the issues with the permit program have been resolved and expects that the Gila River Indian Community can now provide a presentation. Ms. Bauer responded that MAG will follow up with the Gila River Indian Community.

Mr. Kross announced that the next meeting of the Committee has been tentatively scheduled for May 27, 2008 at 1:30 p.m. With no further comments, the meeting was adjourned.

December 4, 2008

TO: Members of the MAG Air Quality Technical Advisory Committee

FROM: Dean Giles, Air Quality Planning Program Specialist

SUBJECT: EVALUATION OF PROPOSED PM-10 PAVING UNPAVED ROAD  
PROJECTS FOR FY 2011 AND FY 2012 CMAQ FUNDING

The Maricopa Association of Governments staff has evaluated proposed PM-10 Paving Unpaved Road Projects for emission reductions and corresponding cost-effectiveness for FY 2011 and FY 2012 Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality Improvement (CMAQ) Funds. For FY 2011, twenty projects requesting approximately \$13.6 million in federal funds were evaluated. Also, for FY 2012, thirteen projects requesting approximately \$9.8 million in federal funds were evaluated. The evaluation of the unpaved road, alley, and shoulder projects are included in the attachment. For each fiscal year, the proposed projects have been listed in order of cost-effectiveness based on the amount of CMAQ funding requested. Following consideration of this information, the MAG Air Quality Technical Advisory Committee will be requested to rank the PM-10 Paving Unpaved Road Projects for FY 2011 and FY 2012 CMAQ funding to be forwarded to the MAG Transportation Review Committee.

#### BACKGROUND

The paving of dirt roads supports committed measures in the MAG Five Percent Plan for PM-10. The FY 2008-2012 MAG Transportation Improvement Program identifies \$3,658,362 in FY 2011 CMAQ funding and \$5,004,000 in FY 2012 CMAQ funding for Paving Unpaved Road Projects. A minimum local cash match of 5.7 percent on the CMAQ eligible portion of the project is required. On August 8, 2008, MAG solicited PM-10 Paving Unpaved Road Projects in the Maricopa County PM-10 Nonattainment Area from member agencies. Project requests were due by September 19, 2008.

#### EVALUATION AND PROJECT RANKING

According to the Draft FY 2009 MAG Federal Fund Programming Principles, project applications are to be reviewed by the MAG Street Committee. On October 16 and October 22, 2008 the Street Committee conducted a review of the PM-10 Paving Unpaved Road project applications. A final review of the paving applications, including any clarified information from the applicant, was provided at the Street Committee meeting on November 12, 2008.

MAG staff estimated the emission reductions and cost-effectiveness using the CMAQ funding requested, based on the revised methodology that has been updated to be consistent with the methodology used in the MAG 2007 Five Percent Plan for PM-10. Federal CMAQ guidance requires that the estimated emission reductions for each project submitted for CMAQ funding be considered during project selection. The evaluation of the proposed FY 2011 and FY 2012 PM-10 Paving Unpaved Road Projects is included in the attachment. The proposed projects have been listed in ascending order of cost-effectiveness based on the amount of CMAQ funding requested.

Following consideration of this information, the MAG Air Quality Technical Advisory Committee will be requested to rank the proposed PM-10 Paving Unpaved Road Projects for FY 2011 and FY 2012 CMAQ funding to be forwarded to the MAG Transportation Review Committee. The MAG Transportation Review Committee may consider the PM-10 Paving Unpaved Road Projects in January 2009. The recommendations may be considered by the MAG Management Committee, the Transportation Policy Committee, and the MAG Regional Council in February 2009.

If you have any questions or need additional information, please contact me at (602) 254-6300.

Attachment

**List of Proposed PM-10 Paving Unpaved Road Projects For FY 2011 CMAQ Funding**  
**\$3,658,362 available in FY 2011 of the FY 2008-2012 MAG Transportation Improvement Program**

Agency	Location	Project Description	Work Type	FY	Length (miles)	Emission Reduction Weighted TOG(kg/day)	Emission Reduction Weighted NOX(kg/day)	Emission Reduction Weighted PM10(kg/day)	Emission Reduction Weighted Total(kg/day)	Cost Effectiveness (CMAQ dollars / metric ton)	CMAQ Funds Requested	Local Funds	Total Cost *
Fort McDowell Yavapai Nation	Hiawatha Hood Rd, SR-87 to 3 miles north (FMYN Phase 3)	Pave approximately 24 feet wide dirt road with an expected minimum cross-section of 4 inches of AC on up to 12 inches of subgrade, as determined by the geotechnical report. Anything more than that would be regarded as more than "paving of a dirt road" and FMYN will provide the additional costs. This roadway leads from State Route 87 north for over ten miles and is the primary access point for several Tribal Enterprises, which generate a lot of recreational and heavy truck traffic. 3 miles	Pave unpaved road	2011	3.0	0.00	0.00	1157.77	1157.77	\$179	\$1,122,877	\$67,873	\$1,190,750
Buckeye	North Watson Road and MC85 Phase I and Phase II	This project proposes to pave two lanes of 3" thick asphalt concrete on 4" of crushed aggregate North Watson Road, ~ 0.25 mile in length north. Phase II will be a continuation of the phase I project where Phase I is the environmental, utility and right of way clearance and Phase II is the construction and implementation of the plan.	Pave unpaved road	2011	0.2	0.00	0.00	40.80	40.80	\$291	\$64,456	\$3,896	\$68,352
Fort McDowell Yavapai Nation	Mustang Way, 1.5 miles north of Fort McDowell Rd, 4 miles north to the northern boundary (Rio Verde) (FMYN Phase 4)	Pave approximately 24 feet wide dirt road with a minimum depth of 3 inches of AC on up to 8 inches of subgrade, as determined by the geotechnical report. This roadway is the continuation of Fort McDowell Road (a MCDOT maintained facility), and connects to the rural community of Rio Verde approximately 5.5 miles north of where Fort McDowell Road currently ends. 4 miles	Pave unpaved road	2011	4.0	0.00	0.00	751.99	751.99	\$291	\$1,187,709	\$71,791	\$1,259,500
Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community	SRP-MIC Pave Dirt Roads Program, Phase 1: McDonald Road and Mesa Drive	Pre-design, design and construction portion of phase 1 of up to 7 miles of dirt roads within the Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community boundaries.	Pave unpaved road	2011	1.8	0.00	0.00	276.35	276.35	\$625	\$938,285	\$56,715	\$995,000
Maricopa County	17th Avenue, Maddock Road to Joy Ranch Road	Paving of an unpaved road in the PM-10 nonattainment area. Dust mitigation, including: Application of 2 inches of asphaltic concrete pavement on compacted native soil; thickened edges as appropriate; and 20 to 24-foot roadway width.	Pave unpaved road	2011	0.5	0.00	0.00	66.24	66.24	\$825	\$296,830	\$17,942	\$314,772
<b>Subtotal</b>											\$3,610,157		
Buckeye	7th Street-Norton Drive from Beloat Road (South)	This project proposes to pave two lanes of 3" thick asphalt concrete on 4" of crushed aggregate on 7th Street, ~ 0.5 mile in length south from Beloat avenue. This road feeds the Town Waste Water Treatment Plant and Fire Training Facility and future Police Training Facility.	Pave unpaved road	2011	0.4	0.00	0.00	25.70	25.70	\$847	\$118,169	\$7,143	\$125,312
Maricopa County	88th Avenue, Deer Valley Road to Williams Road	Paving of an unpaved road in the PM-10 nonattainment area.	Pave unpaved road	2011	0.5	0.00	0.00	67.15	67.15	\$984	\$358,670	\$21,680	\$380,350

**List of Proposed PM-10 Paving Unpaved Road Projects For FY 2011 CMAQ Funding**  
**\$3,658,362 available in FY 2011 of the FY 2008-2012 MAG Transportation Improvement Program**

Agency	Location	Project Description	Work Type	FY	Length (miles)	Emission Reduction Weighted TOG(kg/day)	Emission Reduction Weighted NOX(kg/day)	Emission Reduction Weighted PM10(kg/day)	Emission Reduction Weighted Total(kg/day)	Cost Effectiveness (CMAQ dollars / metric ton)	CMAQ Funds Requested	Local Funds	Total Cost *
Maricopa County	White Wing Road, 171st Avenue (Cotton Lane) to 163rd Avenue (Sarival Avenue)	Paving of an unpaved road in the PM-10 nonattainment area. Dust mitigation, including: Application of 2 inches of asphaltic concrete pavement on compacted native soil; thickened edges as appropriate; and 20 to 24-foot roadway width.	Pave unpaved road	2011	1.0	0.00	0.00	126.45	126.45	\$1,002	\$687,885	\$41,580	\$729,465
Maricopa County	87th Avenue, Deer Valley Road to Peoria CL (Via Montoya Rd)	Paving of an unpaved road in the PM-10 nonattainment area.	Pave unpaved road	2011	0.3	0.00	0.00	25.43	25.43	\$1,348	\$186,146	\$11,252	\$197,398
Phoenix +	2011 CMAQ Alley Dust Proofing	This project will dust proof approximately 41 miles of unstabilized alleys within the City of Phoenix using a 3/8" Fractured Aggregate Surface Treatment (FAST) which provides a single application of rubberized asphalt and pre-coated chips to existing dirt alleys. Clearing, grubbing and subgrade preparation will be required for application of the material.	Pave unpaved alleys	2011	41.2	0.00	0.00	248.61	248.61	\$1,488	\$2,008,445	\$190,000	\$2,198,445
Surprise	Paving Dove Valley Road from 203rd Ave. to 187th Ave	This project will consist of paving approximately two miles of Dove Valley Road located between 203rd Ave. to 187th Ave. The improvements will consist of constructing cut off walls for minor drainage purposes. This project will reduce dust emission in this area.	Pave unpaved road	2011	2.0	0.00	0.00	114.11	114.11	\$1,544	\$956,800	\$68,200	\$1,025,000
Maricopa County	Briles Road, Reems Road (155th Ave) to end of maintenance (151st Ave)	Paving of an unpaved road in the PM-10 nonattainment area.	Pave unpaved road	2011	0.5	0.00	0.00	27.02	27.02	\$2,166	\$317,731	\$19,205	\$336,936
Tempe	Alley Stabilization	The city of Tempe has an ongoing alley reconstruction program which includes removing soil fines and old soil material and replacing with recycled asphalt (RAP). Approximately 130 miles of unpaved alleys remain. Funding this project will allow the city of Tempe to accelerate its stabilization program in order to reduce PM 10 emissions.	Pave unpaved alleys	2011	4.25	0.00	0.00	150.86	150.86	\$2,346	\$1,921,824	\$768,850	\$2,690,674
Youngtown	Youngtown Pave Dirt Alleys, Phase 1	Pre-design, design and paving of approximately 3.8 miles of dirt alleyways within the Town of Youngtown	Pave unpaved alleys	2011	3.8	0.00	0.00	67.70	67.70	\$3,005	\$1,104,959	\$66,790	\$1,171,749
Avondale	McDowell Road, Avondale Blvd. to 107th Avenue	Starting at a point 800 ft west of 107th Ave and ending at a point 2600 ft west of 107th Ave there exists approx 1800 ft (.34 miles) of insufficient unpaved shoulder; the existing shoulders vary from 2 to 2.5 feet. Based upon dust that occurs when vehicular traffic pulls off the road and when the farmers pull off, the City would like to expand the shoulder width to 5-foot MCDOT criteria (Roadway Design Guidelines) Due to exist lane widths, there are no opportunities to re-stripe the roadway.	Pave unpaved shoulders	2011	0.34	0.00	0.00	3.54	3.54	\$7,115	\$136,800	\$8,373	\$145,173
Buckeye ++	Shoulder Paving Belowat Road from Miller to Rainbow	This project proposes to pave two shoulders of 2" thick asphalt concrete w/4" Aggregate base course on Belowat Road, ~ 3 miles in length (east-west).	Pave unpaved shoulders	2011	3	0.00	0.00	10.67	10.67	\$8,200	\$475,000	\$28,712	\$503,712

**List of Proposed PM-10 Paving Unpaved Road Projects For FY 2011 CMAQ Funding**  
**\$3,658,362 available in FY 2011 of the FY 2008-2012 MAG Transportation Improvement Program**

Agency	Location	Project Description	Work Type	FY	Length (miles)	Emission Reduction Weighted TOG(kg/day)	Emission Reduction Weighted NOX(kg/day)	Emission Reduction Weighted PM10(kg/day)	Emission Reduction Weighted Total(kg/day)	Cost Effectiveness (CMAQ dollars / metric ton)	CMAQ Funds Requested	Local Funds	Total Cost *
Avondale	Van Buren Street-99th Avenue to the Aqua Fria River	Along Van Buren Street there are six segments of roadway (1.44 Miles) from 99th Avenue west to the Aqua Fria River of insufficient unpaved shoulder where the exist paved shoulder is non-existent or it does not meet the min width of 5 ft (MCDOT-Rdwy Design Manual). Due to exist lane widths, there is no opportunity to re-stripe the roadway.	Pave unpaved shoulders	2011	1.44	0.00	0.00	8.36	8.36	\$12,582	\$571,300	\$34,538	\$605,838
Avondale	Avondale Blvd-McDowell Road to Encanto	Starting at a McDowell Road and ending at Encanto there exists approximately 2600 ft (.39 miles) of insufficient unpaved shoulder on the Westside of Avondale Blvd. where the exist paved shoulder is non-existent or it does not meet the min width of 5 ft (MCDOT-Rdwy Design Manual). Due to exist lane widths, there is no opportunity to re-stripe the roadway.	Pave unpaved shoulders	2011	0.39	0.00	0.00	2.05	2.05	\$14,175	\$157,600	\$9,557	\$167,157
Avondale	Vermeersch/127th Avenue	Both shoulders of Vermeersch are non-existent causing a dust problem which has been a source of complaints and which has been documented by the County's AIR Quality Unit. A large number of trucks from the local quarry is the mainpoint of the dust. Shoulders would be installed from Lower Buckeye to Broadway. In addition, additional pavement will be added at all driveway locations (up to the right of way line).	Pave unpaved shoulders	2011	1.2	0.00	0.00	1.81	1.81	\$93,760	\$922,488	\$55,761	\$978,249
Goodyear	165th Ave from Watkins to Durango	This segment is currently 18.58' wide with curb and gutter on the east side, we propose to pave 6' of shoulder on the west half of the road to meet the city's typical cross section of a two lane road, this will provide two travel lanes preventing vehicles from driving on the dirt shoulder causing dust.	Pave unpaved shoulders	2011	0.25	0.00	0.00	0.04	0.04	\$576,621	\$124,462	\$7,523	\$131,985
<b>Total</b>											<b>\$13,658,436</b>		

+Phoenix project contains 4.4 miles of alleys to be paved within 1.0 mile of PM-10 monitors.

++ Buckeye project contains a 1-mile segment within 1.0 mile of a PM-10 monitor.

\* Costs shown are only for construction portion of project.

**List of Proposed PM-10 Paving Unpaved Road Projects For FY 2012 CMAQ Funding**  
 \$5,004,000 available in FY 2012 of the FY 2008-2012 MAG Transportation Improvement Program

Agency	Location	Project Description	Work Type	FY	Length (miles)	Emission Reduction Weighted TOG(kg/day)	Emission Reduction Weighted NOX(kg/day)	Emission Reduction Weighted PM10(kg/day)	Emission Reduction Weighted Total(kg/day)	Cost Effectiveness (CMAQ dollars / metric ton)	CMAQ Funds Requested	Local Funds	Total Cost *
Gilbert	Ryan Road Pavement Project	The Town of Gilbert plans to pave Ryan Road between Greenfield Road and 164th Street (approximately 2,580 feet).	Pave unpaved road	2012	0.5	0.00	0.00	108.91	108.91	\$275	\$162,760	\$9,840	\$172,600
Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community	SRP-MIC Pave Dirt Roads Program, Phase 3: Dobson Road and Center Street	Design and construction portion of phase 3 of up to a total of 7 miles of dirt roads within the Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community boundaries.	Pave unpaved road	2012	1.8	0.00	0.00	289.99	289.99	\$587	\$924,140	\$55,860	\$980,000
Gilbert	Walnut Road Pavement Project	The Town of Gilbert plans to pave Walnut Road between 162nd Street and 164th Street (approximately 1,290 feet).	Pave unpaved road	2012	0.3	0.00	0.00	27.23	27.23	\$589	\$87,038	\$5,262	\$92,300
El Mirage	Eastside Downtown Alley Paving Project	Paving existing unpaved alleys in the east side of the downtown area (East of El Mirage Road). The project termini is generally Grand Ave to the north, Thunderbird Avenue to the south, El Mirage Road to the west, and El Frio Street to the east. Alleys to be 16' edge to edge chip and seal with dust proof surface (millings) to edge of alley ROW.	Pave unpaved alleys	2012	2.2	0.00	0.00	86.02	86.02	\$602	\$281,000	\$31,100	\$312,100
El Mirage	Westside Downtown Alley Paving Project	Paving existing unpaved alleys in the west side of the downtown area (West of El Mirage Road). The project termini is generally Santa Fe Lane to the north, Thunderbird Avenue to the south, 5th Avenue to the west, and El Mirage Road to the east. Alleys to be 16' edge to edge chip and seal with dust proof surface (millings) to edge of alley ROW.	Pave unpaved alleys	2012	1.7	0.00	0.00	67.70	67.70	\$604	\$222,000	\$24,500	\$246,500
Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community	SRP-MIC Pave Dirt Roads Program, Phase 2: McDonald Road and Alma School Road	Design and construction portion of phase 2 of up to a total of 7 miles of dirt roads within the Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community boundaries.	Pave unpaved road	2012	1.6	0.00	0.00	269.21	269.21	\$655	\$957,145	\$57,855	\$1,015,000
Gilbert	Bonanza Road Pavement Project	The Town of Gilbert plans to pave Bonanza Road between 156th Street and 157th Street (approximately 730 feet).	Pave unpaved road	2012	0.2	0.00	0.00	10.89	10.89	\$901	\$53,279	\$3,221	\$56,500
Surprise	Paving Dove Valley Road from 163rd Ave. to 179th Ave	This project will consist of paving approximately two miles of Dove Valley Road located between 163rd Ave. to 179th Ave. The improvements will consist of constructing cut off walls for minor drainage purposes. This project will reduce dust emission in this area.	Pave unpaved road	2012	2.0	0.00	0.00	114.11	114.11	\$1,544	\$956,800	\$68,200	\$1,025,000
<b>Subtotal</b>											<b>\$3,644,162</b>		

**List of Proposed PM-10 Paving Unpaved Road Projects For FY 2012 CMAQ Funding**  
**\$5,004,000 available in FY 2012 of the FY 2008-2012 MAG Transportation Improvement Program**

Agency	Location	Project Description	Work Type	FY	Length (miles)	Emission Reduction Weighted TOG(kg/day)	Emission Reduction Weighted NOX(kg/day)	Emission Reduction Weighted PM10(kg/day)	Emission Reduction Weighted Total(kg/day)	Cost Effectiveness (CMAQ dollars / metric ton)	CMAQ Funds Requested	Local Funds	Total Cost *
Phoenix †	2012 CMAQ Alley Dust Proofing	This project will dust proof approximately 40 miles of unstabilized alleys within the City of Phoenix using a 3/8" Fractured Aggregate Surface Treatment (FAST) which provides a single application of rubberized asphalt and pre-coated chips to existing dirt alleys. Clearing, grubbing and subgrade preparation will be required for application of the material.	Pave unpaved alleys	2012	40.0	0.00	0.00	238.31	238.31	\$1,553	\$2,009,471	\$190,000	\$2,199,471
Fort McDowell Yavapai Nation	Hiawatha Hood Rd, 3 miles north to 7 miles north (FMYN Phase 6)	Pave approximately 24 feet wide dirt road with an expected minimum cross-section of 4 inches of AC on up to 12 inches of subgrade, as determined by the geotechnical report. This segment continues the paving of Hiawatha Hood Rd that was requested as Priority One. 4 miles	Pave unpaved road	2012	4.0	0.00	0.00	131.66	131.66	\$1,674	\$1,197,139	\$72,361	\$1,269,500
Fort McDowell Yavapai Nation	Ironwood, Harquahala and Sandtrap Rds (FMYN Phase 5)	Pave approximately 24 feet wide dirt road with a minimum depth of 3 inches of AC on 8 inches of subgrade, as determined by the geotechnical report. Anything more than that would be regarded as more than "paving of a dirt road" and FMYN will provide the additional costs. These are three separate roadways in the same southern area of the FMYN and all three connect at both ends to existing paved roadways. 3.6 miles.	Pave unpaved road	2012	3.6	0.00	0.00	104.95	104.95	\$2,075	\$1,182,522	\$71,478	\$1,254,000
Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community	SRP-MIC Pave Dirt Roads Program, Phase 4: Mesa Drive and Roadrunner Road	Pre-design, design and construction portion of phase 1 of up to 7 miles of dirt roads within the Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community boundaries.	Pave unpaved road	2012	2.0	0.00	0.00	65.83	65.83	\$2,453	\$876,990	\$53,010	\$930,000
Youngtown	Youngtown Pave Dirt Alleys, Phase 2	Pre-design, design and paving of approximately 3.1 miles of dirt alleyways within the Town of Youngtown	Pave unpaved alleys	2012	3.1	0.00	0.00	41.88	41.88	\$3,955	\$899,489	\$54,370	\$953,859
<b>Total</b>											<b>\$9,809,773</b>		

† Phoenix project contains 1.6 miles of alleys to be paved within 1.1 miles of PM-10 monitors in the Salt River Area.

\* Costs shown are only for construction portion of project.

December 4, 2008

TO: Members of the MAG Air Quality Technical Advisory Committee

FROM: Dean Giles, Air Quality Planning Program Specialist

SUBJECT: EVALUATION OF PROPOSED PM-10 CERTIFIED STREET SWEEPER  
PROJECTS FOR FY 2009 CMAQ FUNDING

The Maricopa Association of Governments staff has evaluated proposed PM-10 Certified Street Sweeper Projects for emission reductions and corresponding cost-effectiveness for FY 2009 Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality Improvement (CMAQ) Funds. Fifteen projects requesting approximately \$2.7 million in federal funds were received. The evaluation of these projects and supplemental information are included in the attachment. The proposed projects have been listed in order of cost-effectiveness based on the amount of CMAQ funding requested. Following consideration of this information, the MAG Air Quality Technical Advisory Committee will be requested to recommend a prioritized list of PM-10 Certified Street Sweeper Projects for FY 2009 CMAQ funding and to retain the prioritized list for any additional FY 2009 CMAQ funds that may become available due to year-end closeout, including any redistributed obligation authority, or additional funding received by this region.

### BACKGROUND

The MAG 2007 Five Percent Plan for PM-10 contains the committed measure “PM-10 Efficient Street Sweepers”. The FY 2009 Unified Planning Work Program and FY 2008-2012 MAG Transportation Improvement Program contain \$1,210,000 in FY 2009 CMAQ funding to encourage the purchase and utilization of PM-10 certified street sweepers. The purpose of the CMAQ program is to fund projects and programs in nonattainment and maintenance areas that assist in achieving air quality standards. A minimum local cash match of 5.7 percent on the CMAQ eligible portion of the project is required.

On August 8, 2008, MAG solicited PM-10 certified street sweeper projects in the Maricopa County PM-10 Nonattainment Area from member agencies. Eligible street sweepers are defined as those which have been certified by the South Coast Air Quality Management District as meeting that agency’s Rule 1186 certification standards. Projects requests were due by September 19, 2008.

## EVALUATION AND PROJECT RANKING

According to the Draft FY 2009 MAG Federal Fund Programming Principles, project applications are to be reviewed by the MAG Street Committee. On October 16 and October 22, 2008 the Street Committee conducted a review of the PM-10 Certified Street Sweeper project applications. A final review of the sweeper applications, including any clarified information from the applicant, was provided at the Street Committee meeting on November 12, 2008.

MAG staff estimated the emission reductions and cost-effectiveness using the CMAQ funding requested, based on the revised methodology that has been updated to be consistent with the methodology used in the MAG 2007 Five Percent Plan for PM-10. Federal CMAQ guidance requires that the estimated emission reductions for each project submitted for CMAQ funding be considered during project selection. The FY 2009 PM-10 Certified Street Sweeper Project requests, evaluation, and supplemental information are provided in the attachment. The proposed projects have been listed in ascending order of cost-effectiveness based on the amount of CMAQ funding requested.

Following consideration of this information, the MAG Air Quality Technical Advisory Committee will be requested to make a recommendation on a prioritized list of proposed projects for FY 2009 CMAQ funding to the MAG Management Committee. After the MAG Regional Council approval of projects for funding, MAG will issue a formal notification to proceed with the purchase of the proposed street sweepers in a letter to the project sponsor. It is important to note that the project ranking will be retained for any additional FY 2009 CMAQ funds that may become available due to year-end closeout, including any redistributed obligation authority or additional funding received by this region.

If you have any questions or need additional information, please contact me at (602) 254-6300.

Attachment

# List of Proposed PM-10 Certified Street Sweeper Projects for FY 2009 CMAQ Funding

\$1,210,000 available in FY 2009 of the FY 2008-2012 MAG Transportation Improvement Program

									Supplemental Information				
Agency	Federal Cost	Local Cost	Total Cost*	Daily Emission Reduction (Kilograms/day)	Cost-Effectiveness (CMAQ dollar cost per annual metric ton reduced)	The requested certified street sweeper will:			If project is to expand or increase sweeping frequency, have additional local resources been committed for staff or equipment to support the project?		Please indicate in what geographical area(s) the requested certified street sweeper will operate	Number of certified street sweepers your agency has already purchased.	Does the requested sweeper satisfy a commitment by your agency in the SIP?
						Replace	Expand	Increase Frequency	Yes	No			
Glendale (#1) +	\$190,910	\$11,540	\$202,450	334	\$223	✓				✓	Within city limits.	9	Yes
Glendale (#2) +	\$190,910	\$11,540	\$202,450	334	\$223	✓				✓	Within city limits.	9	Yes
Gilbert (#1)	\$199,331	\$12,049	\$211,380	210	\$371			✓	✓		Baseline Road (north), Val Vista Drive (east), Williams Field Road (south), and Lindsay Road (west)	12	No
Gilbert (#2)	\$199,331	\$12,049	\$211,380	191	\$407			✓	✓		Baseline Road (north), Gilbert Road (east), Ray Road (south), and Cooper Road (west)	12	No
Scottsdale	\$148,618	\$8,983	\$157,601	109	\$530	✓			✓		North of Loop 101 to Carefree Highway, East of 56th Street to 144th Street	8	Yes
Phoenix (#1) +	\$171,798	\$10,385	\$182,183	105	\$638	✓			✓		Camelback Road to Pecos, Central Avenue to 107th Avenue & 111th Avenue	36	Yes
<b>Subtotal</b>	<b>\$1,100,898</b>												
Phoenix (#2) +	\$171,798	\$10,385	\$182,183	105	\$638	✓			✓		Camelback Road to Pecos, Central Avenue to 107th Avenue & 111th Avenue	36	Yes
Paradise Valley	\$174,319	\$43,580	\$217,899	100	\$677	✓				✓	32nd St. to Scottsdale Rd.; Chaparral Rd. to Shea Blvd.	2	Yes
Tempe	\$182,750	\$25,294	\$208,044	51	\$1,388	✓				✓	48th Street East to Evergreen Dr.; US 60 North to Continental Dr.	7	Yes
Scottsdale	\$148,618	\$8,983	\$157,601	32	\$1,802	✓			✓		Via De Ventura to Thunderbird Rd, 60th Street to Pima Road	8	Yes
Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community +	\$137,533	\$8,314	\$145,847	30	\$1,813	✓			✓		Within the boundaries of SRPMIC.	0	No
Chandler +	\$209,097	\$12,639	\$221,736	7	\$11,917	✓			✓		Between Arizona Avenue and Gilbert Road and between Germann Rd and Warner Rd	10	Yes
Youngtown	\$164,659	\$10,000	\$174,659	5	\$14,021			✓	✓		From Grand Avenue to Olive Avenue and from 111th Avenue to 116th Avenue (1.12 square miles)	1	No

						Supplemental Information							
Agency	Federal Cost	Local Cost	Total Cost*	Daily Emission Reduction (Kilograms/day)	Cost-Effectiveness (CMAQ dollar cost per annual metric ton reduced)	The requested certified street sweeper will:			If project is to expand or increase sweeping frequency, have additional local resources been committed for staff or equipment to support the project?		Please indicate in what geographical area(s) the requested certified street sweeper will operate	Number of certified street sweepers your agency has already purchased.	Does the requested sweeper satisfy a commitment by your agency in the SIP?
						Replace	Expand	Increase Frequency	Yes	No			
Buckeye	\$209,871	\$12,685	\$222,557	5	\$18,023		✓	✓	✓		Yuma Rd., Dean Rd .to Watson Rd. - Verrado Way I-10 to Indian School Rd	3	Yes
Buckeye	\$209,871	\$12,685	\$222,557	4	\$19,598		✓		✓		Apache Rd @ Yuma Rd, Beloat @ 255th Ave, Sundance Parkway @ Van Buren St, Hilton Ave @ Dean Rd (East of Dean)	3	Yes
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$2,709,414</b>												

\* Total cost for the CMAQ eligible portion of the project, excludes ineligible equipment.

+ Proposed sweeper projects for Chandler, Glendale #1, Glendale #2, Phoenix #1, Phoenix #2, and Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community indicate sweeping adjacent to a PM-10 monitor.

**TENTATIVE MEETING SCHEDULE FOR THE  
MAG AIR QUALITY TECHNICAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE**

**JANUARY - DECEMBER 2009**

**Saguaro Conference Room**

Thursday, January 29, 2009 - 1:30 p.m.

Thursday, February 26, 2009 - 1:30 p.m.

Thursday, March 26, 2009 - 1:30 p.m.

Thursday, April 30, 2009 - 1:30 p.m.

TUESDAY, May 26, 2009 - 1:30 p.m.

Thursday, June 25, 2009 - 1:30 p.m.

Thursday, July 30, 2009 - 1:30 p.m.

Thursday, August 27, 2009 - 1:30 p.m.      **IF NECESSARY**

Thursday, September 24, 2009 - 1:30 p.m.

Thursday, October 29, 2009 - 1:30 p.m.

Thursday, December 10, 2009 - 1:30 p.m.      **IF NECESSARY**

Note: This schedule is subject to change. Flexibility is needed to meet federal Clean Air Act mandates and changes in guidance from the Environmental Protection Agency.