

MARICOPA ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS (MAG)
REGIONAL DOMESTIC VIOLENCE COUNCIL & CONTINUUM OF CARE
REGIONAL COMMITTEE ON HOMELESSNESS
MEETING MINUTES – SEPTEMBER 14, 2009

REGIONAL DOMESTIC VIOLENCE COUNCIL
MEMBERS ATTENDING:

President Diane Enos, Salt River Pima-
Maricopa Indian Community, Chair
Lt. Robert Bates, Phoenix Police Dept.
Kristen Scharlau for Kathy Berzins, City of
Tempe
John A. Blackburn, Jr., AZ Criminal Justice
Commission
Allie Bones, Arizona Coalition Against
Domestic Violence
*Grace Carrillo, Neighborhood and Family
Services Commission
*Chris Christy, Salt River Pima-Maricopa
Indian Community
Suzanne Cohen, Maricopa County
Attorney's Office
*Councilmember William Conner, City of
El Mirage
JoAnn Del-Colle, Phoenix Family
Advocacy Center
Will Gonzalez, City of Phoenix
Prosecutor's Office
Laura Guild, Arizona Dept. of Economic
Security
*Cindy Hallman, Marley House
+Linda Melendez for Dan Hughes, City of
Surprise

*Cmdr. Kim Humphrey, City of Phoenix
Police Dept., Vice Chair
Karla Houston for Lynette Jelinek, Glendale
Fire Dept.
Alice Ghareib for Mary Lynn Kasunic,
Area Agency on Aging
*Patricia Klahr, Chrysalis Shelter Inc.
Councilmember Phil Lieberman, City of
Glendale
*Jodi Beckley Liggett, Arizona Foundation
for Women
Jeremy Arp for Maria-Elena Ochoa,
Governor's Office for Children Youth and
Families
Dottie O'Connell, Chicanos Por la Causa
*Stephanie Olohan, City of Goodyear
Connie Phillips, Sojourner Center
Lynn Potts for John Pombier, City of Mesa
Kerry Ramella, City of Phoenix Fire Dept.
Sarah Youngblood, Community Legal
Services

+ Those attending by video/audio
conference

* Those not present or represented by proxy

CONTINUUM OF CARE REGIONAL COMMITTEE ON HOMELESSNESS
MEMBERS ATTENDING:

Shana Ellis, Vice Mayor, City of Tempe, Chair
Roberto Armijo, Community Information &
Referral Services
David Barnhouse, Governor's Office
*Brad Bridwell, U.S. Vets
*Kathryn Brown, Arizona Dept. of Corrections
*Kendra Cea, APS
Councilmember Steve Frate, Glendale
Christina Soto for Victor Hudenko, Catholic
Charities community Services
Theresa James, City of Tempe
Councilman Michael Johnson, City of Phoenix
Tim Cole for Deanna Jonovich, City of
Phoenix
*Don Keuth, Phoenix Community Alliance,
Vice Chair
*Stephanie Knox, Magellan health Services of
Arizona
Mattie Lord, Arizona Department of Economic
Security
Mark Ludwig, AZ Department of Housing
*Dan Lundberg, City of Surprise
*Nick Margiotta, Phoenix Police Dept.

Mike McQuaid, Human Services Campus
*Linda Mushkatel, Maricopa County Chief
Resource Office
Gary Zeck for Darlene Newsom, United
Methodist Outreach Ministries
Councilmember Joanne Osborne, City of
Goodyear
Gina Ramos Montes, City of Avondale
*Brenda Robbins, AZ Dept of Health Services
Amy Schwabenlender, Valley of the Sun
United Way
Laura Skotnicki, Save the Family
Jacki Taylor, Arizona Coalition to End
Homelessness
*Margaret Trujillo, MG Trujillo Associates
*Supervisor Mary Rose Wilcox, Maricopa
County
*Ted Williams, AZ Behavioral Health
Corporation
Diana Yazzie Devine, Native American
Connections

+ Those attending by video/audio conference
* Those not present or represented by proxy

OTHERS PRESENT

Lidia Arrazola, Valle Del Sol
Christopher Bartz, Recovery Innovations of
Arizona
Mike Bell, St. Vincent de Paul
Cara Chaney, Valle del Sol
Jenny Day, Basic Mission
Kathy DiNolfi, A New Leaf
Robert Duvall, Community Information &
Referral
Jon Eliason, Maricopa County Attorney's
Office
Andy Hall, DES
Katie Hobbs, Sojourner Center

Mark Holleran, CASS
Paty Iniguez, GOCYF
Jessye Johnson, Elim House
Katie Komar, GOCYF
Kristen Krey, City of Glendale
+Nancy Marion, House of Refuge
Frank Nagy, Homeward bound
Marlena Pena, The Salvation Army
Milon Pitts, Homeward Bound
Linda Scott, JFCS
Michelle Thomas, CIR
Yvonne Taylor, Catholic Charities

1. Call to Order

President Diane Enos, Chair of the Regional Domestic Violence Council, called the meeting to order at 1:43 pm. She said the collaborative meeting will further the partnership and collective efforts of both Committees. Chair Enos welcomed everyone and thanked them for attending the second joint meeting of the MAG Regional Domestic Violence Council and the MAG Continuum of Care Regional Committee on Homelessness.

Vice Mayor Ellis, Chair of the Continuum of Care Regional Committee on Homelessness, said the meeting is a special occasion, not only because both Committees are working together collaboratively to end homelessness and domestic violence, but because both are celebrating ten year anniversaries. Chair Ellis invited everyone to join her in a round of applause for the great work and accomplishments over the past ten years. Introductions ensued.

2. Call to the Audience

An opportunity was provided for the public to address the Committees on items that are not on the agenda that fall within the jurisdiction of MAG, or non action agenda items that are on the agenda for discussion or information only. Chair Enos asked for comments from the public. No comments were made.

3. MAG Committee Operating Policies and Procedures Overview

Chair Ellis informed Committee members the MAG Regional Council approved the MAG Committee Operating Policies and Procedures on July 22, 2009. She said the approval of these policies and procedures modifies, and in some cases clarifies, the understanding and former practice of several MAG processes. Chair Ellis introduced Alana Chavez, MAG Administration, to provide an overview of the MAG Committee Operating Policies and Procedures.

Ms. Chavez said the process to review the operating policies and procedures started at the beginning of 2009. Those revisions included officer appointments on technical and other policy level committees. On July 22, 2009, the MAG Regional Council approved the new MAG Committee Operating Policies and Procedures. Ms. Chavez said the Executive Committee will vote on new appointments at the September 21, 2009 meeting.

Ms. Chavez said staff was asked to look at committees that have had the same Chair or Vice Chair for two or more years. She noted in some cases, only the Vice Chair position was affected as with the case with the Continuum of Care. Ms. Chavez said appointments for the Regional Domestic Violence Council will occur in November. In October, Committee members will receive a memo from staff soliciting interest for Chair or Vice Chair officer positions. Ms. Chavez directed the Committee members to the information provided in their agenda packets for additional information.

Ms. Chavez also addressed the issue of quorum noting MAG legal counsel is very specific about this issue. She said for a Committee to continue business, quorum

must be established with members present either by teleconference or in person. Ms. Chavez opened the topic for questions from Committee members. Councilmember Michael Johnson, City of Phoenix, asked for clarification on technical and policy committee appointments. Ms. Chavez said the Executive Committee will appoint the Chair and Vice Chair of the technical and policy Committees, with the exception of the Transportation Policy Committee.

Ms. St. Peter added the MAG Human Services Division staffs three policy and two technical committees. The policy committees include the Human Services Coordinating Committee, Continuum of Care Regional Committee on Homelessness, and the Regional Domestic Violence Council. The technical committees include the Human Services Technical Committee and the Elderly Persons and Persons with Disabilities Transportation Program Committee.

4. MAG 2009 Shelter Capacity Study

Chair Enos said a recommendation to update the 2005 MAG report “The Need for Increased Domestic Violence Shelter” was made at the first joint Committee meeting last December. The recommendation included updating the 2005 report and expanding the study to look at emergency homeless shelter capacity as well as domestic violence shelter capacity. Chair Enos said the initial research indicated that people are sometimes turned away from shelter when there is still room available. The goal of the study was to determine how often this occurs in the region and why. Chair Enos invited MAG Intern, Christine Glass, from the ASU School of Social and Family Dynamics, to provide a report on the results of the study.

Ms. Glass addressed the Committees stating data for the 2009 Shelter Capacity Study was collected over a 28-day study period this summer. Results are currently being analyzed and will be shared in more detail at a future meeting. Ms. Glass said initial results revealed three common reasons why people were turned away from shelter:

- No vacancy
- Individual is not a victim of domestic violence or is not homeless
- Refusal to follow shelter rules

Ms. Glass said the research also revealed interesting ways to maximize shelter capacity. She provided the following additional details:

- Seventeen shelters returned data for the study. Of those, 10 were domestic violence shelters and seven were homeless shelters.
- There were 1,375 denials of request for shelter reported.
- There was an average of 81 denials per shelter, three denials per shelter per day; or an average of 49 each day.

Ms. Glass said as a result of the study, staff is considering the creation of a reference guide that would direct people to the most appropriate shelter for their specific circumstances. She said the full report will be available for approval at the next

Committee meeting. Ms. Glass opened the topic for questions from the Committee. Chair Enos asked for clarification regarding refusal to follow shelter rules; specifically, whether or not someone would be denied shelter if they had refused to follow the shelter rules in the past. Ms. Glass said the study only took into consideration current situations. Chair Enos asked if there is a way to assess if individuals may have refused to follow shelter rules as a result of emotional or psychological issues. Ms. Glass said the survey did ask if individuals were turned away for behavioral health reasons. She noted there was not an overwhelming response to that specific question and suggested further in-depth research would be required.

Sarah Youngblood, Community Legal Services, asked how many individuals were accepted into shelter during the study period. Ms. Glass advised the study focused on individuals who were denied shelter; as such, information on individuals accepted into shelter is not available from the study. She said the survey asked shelters to report acceptances, however, most only completed the section for denials. Ms. Glass suggested the information may be available through Community Information and Referral. Ms. Bones asked if the survey questioned the total number of request made or just requests versus denials. Ms. Glass advised the survey did ask the total number of requests, noting there was some confusion on the survey questions and further work is being done to clarify those issues.

Roberto Armijo, Community Information and Referral, asked if demographics were collected for the 1,375 individuals denied shelter. Ms. Glass said research through ASU does not allow collection of identifying information; therefore only the request and reason for denial was captured. Mr. Armijo said collecting demographics would have been very valuable as it pertains to denials noting a large piece of data is missed when demographics are not collected. He asked if information was collected on which shelters reported denials. Ms. Glass advised a list of participating shelters is available, however all data will be aggregately reported, based on ASU's research requirements.

Ms. Phillips recalled the 2005 MAG study was based on room availability and did not take into consideration whether an individual was homeless or a victim of domestic violence. Taking that into consideration, Ms. Phillips said decisions were not based on a specific factor related to demographics and the same may or may not be applicable in the current study.

Mr. Armijo said having worked with CONTACTS, he recalled instances of individuals not receiving service due to language barriers at shelters. He suggested demographics are important because the more that is known about the subject, the more that can be done. Ms. Glass said the survey did ask about denials based on language barriers, however, detailed information specific to the language was not captured. Ms. Bones cautioned staff to be very clear on how denials are reported. Gary Zeck, UMOM, asked for clarification on the likelihood of duplication. Ms. Glass said the survey requested unduplicated requests for shelter.

Ms. St. Peter thanked Ms. Glass for her efforts on the study. She said shelter staffing issues was another reason for not collecting personal demographic information. Given limited staffing, it was determined some shelters may be precluded from participating in the study if they were burdened with the request to collect additional data beyond what they normally capture. Ms. St. Peter said staff will make every attempt to report data in a responsible and accurate manner. She added due to the limited timeframe, the focus of the study remained within the parameters of the research study as designed and as approved by both Committees.

Councilmember Steve Frate, City of Glendale, expressed concern regarding the number of families going into shelters and families being separated because of shelter regulations prohibiting teenagers. Councilmember Frate requested additional information on the number of families that were denied shelter because of teenage children. Mattie Lord, Arizona Department of Economic Security, asked for a breakout of the number of domestic violence victims requesting shelter versus homeless individuals. Ms. Glass advised the requested information will be provided in the final report along with additional detailed information. She clarified the study did not include transitional housing. Chair Enos thanked Ms. Glass for her work on the study.

5. Screening Principles Statement

Chair Ellis said another recommendation made by the joint Committee last December was development of a Screening Principles Statement. The statement would include standards of treatment for all people served in shelters in the region. Chair Ellis invited Brande Mead and Renae Tenney to present the Screening Principles Statement developed by the working group.

Ms. Mead directed the Committee to the handout in the agenda packet. She said the purpose of the project is to create a standard of treatment for all people served in shelters with the goal of developing a regional standard of treatment that would bring shelters together. Ms. Mead said the statement was developed by the working group with feedback from both Committees.

Ms. Tenney advised feedback was received on people already in emergency and transitional shelters as well as for people seeking shelter and individuals in shelter. She said the statement was narrowed down to focus on people *seeking* shelter. Ms. Tenney requested the Committee review the proposed Screening Principles Statement and provide feedback on whether or not to expand the statement to include people already in shelter.

Dottie O'Connell, Chicanos por la Causa, clarified the grievance process and confidentiality issues are addressed only for people in shelter; noting those issues are not necessarily reviewed with people seeking shelter. Ms. Tenney agreed those issues may not be applicable to emergency shelters. Ms. St. Peter asked if the statement, when considering best practices, should specify "as appropriate" or "per agency

policy” as it relates to the right to appeal or grievance process. Ms. Phillips expressed concern about the statement. She said it is unclear and raises many questions. Ms. Phillips asked if it would be appropriate to make a motion to table the topic until questions are clarified. Ms. St. Peter asked the Committee to provide feedback on specific areas of concern to better direct the working group. Ms. Bones said initial discussion reflected a much broader statement, adding the current document delves into the details of shelter policy which may hinder the document from moving forward.

Councilmember Joanne Osborne asked if the document would be brought back to the joint Committee if it were tabled until further revisions were made. Ms. Tenney advised the document would be presented separately at each Committee meeting and not be held until the next joint meeting. Councilmember Johnson asked how the issue of translation is handled by the shelters. Ms. Tenney advised translation lines are utilized by most shelters. Mr. Armijo said CONTACTS also uses the services provided by a language line. Councilmember Johnson commented on the number of unknown people who are in need of shelter but are reluctant to go through the process due to language barriers.

Ms. Tenney sought confirmation from the Committees to table the topic and go back to the working group for further revisions. Ms. St. Peter asked for confirmation that the Committee members were requesting a separate document for emergency and transitional housing. The Committee expressed consensus. Mr. Armijo said he liked the statement as it had very good principles. Jacki Taylor, Arizona Coalition to End Homelessness, suggested reviewing guidelines from the Council on Accreditation for Homeless Shelters as a guide for higher levels of principles. JoAnn Del-Colle, Phoenix Family Advocacy Center, suggested there be a consensus among Committee members to ask the working group for a broader statement as opposed to a document that is too specific. Mr. Zeck agreed and suggested separate documents be avoided.

Councilmember Lieberman said he liked the statement as it was currently written. He motioned to accept the Maricopa Association of Governments Screening Principles Statement. Mr. Armijo seconded the motion. Ms. Phillips said shelters do not provide information on limits of confidentiality nor do they provide information on grievance to an individual seeking shelter. As such, she will not vote in support of the motion as it is not what is occurring in domestic violence shelters.

Laura Skotnicki, Save the Family, suggested including Ms. St. Peter’s previous suggestion to add the words “per agency policy”. She said the document seems broad with the exception of the grievance and confidentiality issues. Ms. St. Peter suggested another option would be to remove any bullet point that does not apply, however, she noted the motion would need to be amended.

Councilmember Lieberman suggested the Committee vote on each point separately. Ms. Mead said the document would need to clarify grievance process and confidentiality. She recommended revising bullet point three as follows:

Currently written:

- To provide confidential services and inform those seeking shelter about the limits of confidentiality.

Proposed change:

- To provide confidential services and inform those seeking shelter about the limits of confidentiality *per agency policy*.

Ms. Phillips questioned the need to include the proposed language in the statement if the determination is being left to the agency policy. Ms. St. Peter suggested removing bullet point seven from the statement.

Bullet point seven:

To provide information about the shelter's grievance processes to those seeking shelter.

Chair Ellis asked for an amendment to the motion. Councilmember Lieberman motioned to approve the Screening Principles Statement as amended in bullet points three and seven. Councilmember Johnson seconded the motion. The motion passed.

Mr. Armijo noted a suggestion made by Robert Duvall, CIR, regarding bullet point nine. Mr. Duvall addressed the Committee suggesting that the final sentence, "this will be done in a manner that protects the personally identifying information of those seeking shelter", could hinder future Homeless Management Information System data sharing agreements.

Ms. St. Peter noted the document had been approved, noting a new motion would be required if additional changes were to be made. Having no requests to amend the document, Ms. St. Peter said the document can be revised in the future or a new statement can be developed to address those concerns.

Chair Enos excused herself from the meeting as she had a prior engagement to attend.

6. Collaborative Goals for 2010

The Committees participated in a planning exercise to develop collaborative areas of focus for the MAG Regional Domestic Violence Council and the MAG Continuum of Care Regional Committee on Homelessness in 2010.

Ms. St. Peter shared a comment made that MAG is on the cutting edge nationally in terms of collaboration between homelessness and domestic violence. She acknowledged Committee members for their commitment and focus. Ms. St. Peter recalled the four previous projects addressed by the joint Committees: 1) Screening Principles Statement, 2) Shelter Capacity Study, 3) Shelter Screening Questions, 4) Service Matrix.

She asked for input on areas of concern that both Committees can address together in the next fiscal year. She reminded Committee members of the recommendation made at the last Domestic Violence Council meeting to work with the Public Housing Authority (PHA) to provide additional training on how to appropriately house domestic violence victims. She clarified this request is not intended to discredit the work being done by public housing authorities but rather to support them. The committee expressed consensus.

Ms. Youngblood said Community Legal Services is conducting research in this area. She said the Coalition is also assisting in this effort. Ms. St. Peter asked if the project is in need of additional support. Ms. Bones said they are in the early stages and additional support could be used to conduct interviews and speak with the PHA's.

Councilmember Johnson recommended looking at more regional homeless services.

Mike McQuaid said Human Services Campus hosted Project Homeless Connect. He said it shows the collaboration that takes place and is a fantastic experience for the client and staff. He acknowledged Amy Schwabenlender for her efforts and a job well done.

Councilmember Johnson recommended looking at individuals released from the Department of Corrections. He said individuals are released to the streets, however, being released from the Department of Corrections does not classify an individual as permanently homeless. He said these types of releases create issues for homeless shelters in that they come under an enormous amount of pressure from the community.

Ms. St. Peter noted the collaboration already underway between the homeless and domestic violence committees. She said the Human Services Division also addresses human services transportation issues. The Division has focused on integrating all work in order to address people more holistically. She gave an example of UMOM having been awarded a Section 5310 van; noting this is the first time this has occurred. She asked Committee members if there are other transportation needs for people experiencing homelessness or domestic violence that can be addressed through collaboration. Ms. Schwabenlender said transportation is always a barrier for individuals wanting to participate in the Project Homeless Connect events. She noted issues with one-day passes, transportation to outlying areas, and the need for gas vouchers.

Councilmember Osborne said this topic would be an excellent item for both Committees. Ms. St. Peter agreed stating there are significant barriers that face people on sides. Ms. Skotnicki said another issue and one of the biggest expenses is families with children and the issue of getting the children back and forth.

Ms. Bones suggested cross-training efforts between shelters as a collaborative project.

Councilmember Osborn said there are also issues with teenagers released from foster care with no permanent address. She said this is a similar issue to offenders released from the Department of Corrections and needs to be addressed as well.

Ms. St. Peter said the recommendations made for Collaborative Goals for 2010 are on the agenda for action. Following approval, work will begin to further refine the goals. The collaborative areas of focus recommended by the joint Committee include:

- Transportation needs to access shelter and services
- Department of Correction releases, especially sex offenders
- Teenagers released from foster care
- Training for Public Housing Authorities, in collaboration with Community Legal Services and the Arizona Coalition Against Domestic Violence
- Measuring and achieving a more regional service delivery
- Cross-training for shelter staff

Councilmember Osborne motioned to approve the collaborative goals for 2010. Councilmember Johnson seconded the motion. The motion passed.

7. Comments from the Regional Domestic Violence Council and Continuum of Care Regional Committee on Homelessness

An Opportunity was provided for committee members to present a brief summary of current events.

Ms. Taylor announced the Annual Statewide Conference on Homelessness scheduled for October 26 – 27, 2009. Additional details and registration is available on the Web site.

8. Request for Future Agenda Items
No requests were made

9. Adjourn
The meeting adjourned at 2:50 p.m.

The next Regional Domestic Violence Council meeting is scheduled for December 3, 2009 at 1:00 p.m. in the Saguaro Room at the MAG offices.

The next Continuum of Care Regional Committee on Homelessness will meet October 19, 2009 at 2:00 p.m. in the Saguaro Room at the MAG offices.