

MARICOPA ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS
REGIONAL DOMESTIC VIOLENCE COUNCIL
MEETING MINUTES – APRIL 2, 2009

MEMBERS ATTENDING

*President Diane Enos, Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community, Chair
Lt. Robert Bates, Phoenix Police Dept.
Kristen Scharlau for Kathy Berzins, City of Tempe
Tony Vidale for John A. Blackburn, Jr., AZ Criminal Justice Commission
Allie Bones, Arizona Coalition Against Domestic Violence
*Grace Carrillo, Neighborhood and Family Services Commission
*Jennifer Casaletto, Maricopa Medical Center
Chris Christy, Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community
*Suzanne Cohen, Maricopa County Attorney's Office
*Councilmember William Conner, City of El Mirage
Libby Bizza for JoAnn Del-Colle, Phoenix Family Advocacy Center
Laura Guild, Arizona Dept. of Economic Security
*Cindy Hallman, Marley House
Diana Hinz, City of Phoenix Prosecutor's Office
*Councilmember Brenda Holland, City of Goodyear
*Dan Hughes, City of Surprise
Cmdr. Kim Humphrey, City of Phoenix Police Dept., Vice Chair
*Lynette Jelinek, Glendale Fire Dept.
Alice Ghareib for Mary Lynn Kasunic, Area Agency on Aging

*Patricia Klahr, Chrysalis Shelter Inc.
Kristen Krey for Phil Lieberman, City of Glendale
*Jodi Beckley Liggett, Arizona Foundation for Women
Maria-Elena Ochoa, Governor's Office
Dottie O'Connell, Chicanos Por la Causa
*Stephanie Olohan, City of Goodyear
Janice Parker, Save the Family Foundation
Katie Hobbs for Connie Phillips, Sojourner Center
Lynn Potts for John Pombier, City of Mesa
Kerry Ramella, City of Phoenix Fire Dept.
Sarah Youngblood, Community Legal Services

OTHERS PRESENT

Sgt. Randy Hutson, Phoenix Police Dept.
Sgt. Derek Elmore, Phoenix Police Dept.
Sgt. David Albertson, Phoenix Police Dept.
Julie Allison, DES/Family Connections
Angie Wold, Maricopa County Attorney's Office
Teresa Livingston, US Vets
Sandy Robertson, A New Leaf
Leah Meyers, Governor's Office, Division for Women
Jill Messing, Arizona State University

+ Those attending by video/audio conference

* Those not present or represented by proxy

1. Call to Order

Vice Chair Kim Humphrey, Commander, Phoenix Police Department, called the meeting to order at 1:13 p.m. Introductions ensued. Vice Chair Humphrey noted the Committee

did not have quorum. He therefore delayed the meeting minutes until quorum was reached.

2. Call to the Audience

No comments were made.

3. Economic Impact on Human Services

Tim Schmaltz, Protecting Arizona's Family Coalition (PAFCO), presented a report on the impact of funding cuts in human services with a focus on domestic violence. He said PAFCO is a non-profit coalition representing health and human service agencies from across Arizona. The groups, whose principles include strength and power in diversity, work together for the common good. Mr. Schmaltz gave an overview of the economic situation and budget cuts implemented in FY2009 affecting various programs throughout Arizona.

Mr. Schmaltz said the effects of the current economic situation are so big it is difficult to grasp the full picture. He stressed the need to build relationships, be engaged, tell the story, advocate, and educate about what is happening in the region. Allie Bones, Arizona Coalition against Domestic Violence (AzCADV), asked Mr. Schmaltz to elaborate on "How to tell the story". Mr. Schmaltz advised her to reference slide 27 of his presentation handout. Mr. Schmaltz said no one is a blank slate; the story needs to be shaped to appeal to people's best nature and packaged to tell the consequences in a variety of ways. He emphasized using facts and stories combined with pressure. He said the one sign of hope he can leave everyone with is everyone can make a difference.

Sarah Youngblood, Community Legal Services, clarified some of the cuts mentioned in the presentation have already gone into effect for FY2009 and the proposed cuts are for FY2010. In terms of hope, Ms. Bones said there are alternative options such as the Governor's plan and the House Democratic proposal that does not cut the Arizona Department of Economic Security (DES) funds while applying minimal cuts to other services.

4. Approval of the February 5, 2009 Meeting Minutes

Vice Chair Humphrey noted quorum was reached. He called for approval of the February 5, 2009 Regional Domestic Violence Council meeting minutes. Ms. Bones made a motion to approve the minutes as presented. Laura Guild, Arizona Department of Economic Security, seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

5. New Deployment Strategy for Phoenix Domestic Violence Detectives

Lt. Robert Bates, Phoenix Police Department, discussed a new deployment strategy for Phoenix detectives working domestic violence calls. He gave a brief history of his experience working for the police department with the most recent year providing greater involvement in domestic violence. Lt. Bates referenced a 1984 television movie titled *The Burning Bed* and talked about the impact the movie had on him.

Lt. Bates acknowledged Commander Jeff Hines of the Central City Precinct. He talked about Commander Hines' efforts in taking ownership of cleaning up East Van Buren. He also noted the partnership Commander Hines formed with Joanne Del-Colle, Phoenix Advocacy Center, in addressing the overload of cases involving domestic violence, missing persons, and several other types of cases. He recognized other partners involved in collaborating and building the project including Dr. Jill Messing, ASU; Sgt. Derek Elmore; Sgt. Randy Hutson; and Sgt. David Albertson of the Phoenix Police Department.

Sgt. Elmore gave a presentation titled: *Developing a New Domestic Violence Response Plan*. He said the project started in June with limited resources and has three focal points: Caseload Modality, Redeployment, and Partners.

Sgt. Elmore said the police department wants to begin making a distinction in the case loads. He said each case has an impact on the entire system and currently there is no distinction or way of knowing which situations are the most dangerous. He showed a video clip of Lucille Ball and Ethel Mertz wrapping pieces of chocolate candy as they come down a conveyer belt. In the video, the conveyer belt speed increases and Lucy and Ethel are unable to keep up with wrapping each piece of candy. Sgt. Elmore said the candies are representative of the case load, however, each case is different.

Sgt. Elmore gave an overview of the plan summary:

- Part 1: Caseload Modality. Cases will be grouped by control and immediacy of danger by measuring four key history areas. Examples of control include using violence or threats of violence including physical, sexual and financial control. All cases will be looked at by both first and second responders.
- Part 2: Redeploying Sergeants. Sgt. Elmore said research has shown repeat offenders remain in one or two locations. Sergeants are being redeployed from one central location to geographically defined field locations where they will work closely with patrol officers.
- Part 3: Partnering with patrol officers, first responders, advocates, prosecutors, probation officers, and others to build collaboration.

Vice Chair Commander Humphrey asked about the process for determining the project's effectiveness. Sgt. Elmore said they are working with the Morrison Institute to measure the project's outcomes. He said another indicator is better prosecution of offenders. Ms. Youngblood asked if victim advocates go out on calls and if so, how soon after the call is received. Sgt. Elmore said victim advocates meet with victims within 24 hours. He said the project is being implemented in phases. They have begun by redeploying Sergeants, making contact with patrol officers, and working with Dr. Messing. Lynn Potts, City of Mesa, asked if having the sergeants in the field will help to build the relationships and offer training resulting in officers identifying domestic violence with more accuracy. Sgt. Elmore said there is a training aspect as well as a partnership being built that will benefit everyone throughout the system through improved communication and collaboration. Lt. Bates referenced *The Burning Bed* as a great example of the cumulative effect of domestic violence. In the movie, each incident did not cause great injury, but the overall

outcome was devastating. Lt. Bates said in terms of the new plan, phase one will be a good way to determine the potential seriousness of the situation.

Ms. Youngblood asked if they anticipate a greater number of prosecutions. Sgt. Elmore said they anticipate a greater number of *successful* prosecutions. The results of greater involvement could lead to increased counseling or fewer repeat calls. Ms. Tenney asked how soon the program will be fully implemented. Sgt. Elmore said before summer.

Lt. Bates read an excerpt from Evan Stark's book *Coercive Control* (2007) in which the author describes a culmination of incidents leading to the killing of Nicole Brown Simpson and Ronald Goldman in June 1994. He added part of the challenge is changing the culture. Kristen Krey, City of Glendale, said she spent 15 years in law enforcement. She commended the Phoenix Police Department for thinking outside the box and moving forward with their plan. Vice Chair Commander Humphrey acknowledged the work being done and the department's efforts to engage the Morrison Institute, ASU and others to help determine if the plan is working and offer suggestions for improvement, if necessary.

6. Youth Empowerment Project Update

Renae Tenney, MAG, presented an update on Youth Empowerment Project (YEP) activities including message testing results and plans for the PSA Recognition Event. Ms. Tenney expressed her gratitude for the Governor's Innovative Domestic Violence Grant. She said the Youth Empowerment Project would not have been possible without funding from the grant. Ms. Tenney said the PSA Recognition Event is scheduled for Monday, April 27, 2009 at the Heard Museum. She thanked President Diane Enos for her assistance in securing a location for the event and JoAnn Del Colle, Phoenix Family Advocacy Center, for providing gift cards for the winners.

Ms. Tenney reported the winning entries were message tested with groups of teens throughout the Valley representing diversity in geography and socio-economic status. She said the winning entries were presented to the Avondale Youth Advisory Commission, the Tempe Mayor's Youth Council, and Suns-Diamondbacks Education Academy students for input in February. Based on the input received, prototypes of the entries were created.

Ms. Tenney said in reviewing the print ad, teens were not sure what the graphic was supposed to represent. Because the graphic is an arm cast, Ms. Tenney created an actual cast using gauze and plaster of paris. She said a photograph will be taken of the cast after words are written on it relating to physical and/or emotional abuse replicating the concept of the original entry. Committee members received a list of words from the original print ad and were asked to select their top ten choices. Ms. St. Peter said some of the words are important but are longer phrases. She asked Committee members to suggest alternate words depicting the same meaning such as sexual assault being changed to rape. Ms. Youngblood suggested adding *choking* and *name calling* to the list.

Ms. Tenney said a second issue surfaced about the use of song lyrics in the Web banner entry. She said the song lyrics were not familiar to all demographics. She also noted copyright issues were researched with MAG's legal consultant. Although there would most likely not be an issue with using the lyrics, it was decided to change the lyrics to something that would reach all demographics. Ms. St. Peter recalled earlier discussion and concern about the lyrics glorifying violence. She also noted one of the message testing groups had a higher percentage of minorities who were not familiar with the song. She said the preference is to come up with something original.

Ms. St. Peter asked Committee members to share their ideas. Kerry Ramella, Phoenix Fire Department, asked if the message was clear, even though the lyrics were not recognized. Ms. St. Peter replied it was not clear the lyrics were against domestic violence. Because the group had not heard the entire song, the lyrics were open to interpretation. The preferred option is not to take the risk by using the lyrics.

The Committee discussed various suggestions and narrowed it down to using words from the victim's point of view. Suggestions include: How do you feel when you're put down, pushed to the ground, is it worth having them around? Ms. St. Peter offered to have staff develop a final version which could be brought forward at the June Committee meeting for approval. Ms. Ramella made a motion to move forward with the general concept. Katie Hobbs, Sojourner Center, seconded the motion. The motion passed.

7. Legal Assistance Study

Renae Tenney, MAG, provided an update on the Legal Assistance Study. She acknowledged Richard Toon, Morrison Institute, who has been a tremendous help. She said they are working through the results and are close to having a rough draft of the survivor section completed. She stressed the need to be sure the information is correct before being released. Ms. Tenney said the results will be brought before the Committee in June.

Ms. Tenney asked for volunteers to commit to reading the report and providing feedback prior to the June meeting. Ms. St. Peter said a draft report will be distributed to the entire Committee and everyone is welcome to read and provide feedback. The following Committee members agreed to either read or appoint someone from their agency to read and provide feedback prior to the June Regional Domestic Violence Council meeting: Laura Guild, Kristen Krey, Allie Bones, Dottie O'Connell and Sarah Youngblood.

Ms. St. Peter clarified that preliminary findings were presented in December. However, since that time, it has been determined that not all data had been interpreted correctly. Therefore, Ms. Tenney and Mr. Toon are carefully reviewing the data to ensure accuracy. Ms. Tenney said the report will be distributed by May 18, 2009, for review and feedback.

8. Community Partner Updates

Update from the Governor's Commission to Prevent Violence Against Women

Maria-Elena Ochoa, Governor's Office for Children, Youth and Families, Division for Women, provided an update from the Governor's Commission to Prevent Violence Against Women. She said the Governor's Commission to Prevent Violence against Women will meet on April 9, 2009, at 1:00 p.m. As part of the Commission's work, the Division for Women has a Domestic Violence Fatality Review Team work group. Chief Monahan, Apache Junction Police Department, and Dr. Neil Websdale met to promote the plan in Chandler and to the East Valley Chief's Association. Ms. Ochoa said there have been 174 domestic violence related fatalities in the East Valley from 1998–2008.

Ms. Ochoa said the Governor's Office was recently informed by the Department of Justice that Arizona is in compliance with Violence Against Women Act (VAWA). She said compliance is required to receive STOP Violence Against Women grant funding. Ms. Ochoa said they are now going into phase two which focuses on reinforcing compliance by providing education and training throughout the state. Ms. Ochoa also noted the Commission applied for stimulus recovery act STOP Violence Against Women Grant funds, which if awarded will be a one-time award. Should they receive funding, the Governor's Office hopes to make decisions on awarding the funding by mid- September.

Update from the Arizona Foundation for Women

Ms. Bones reported on behalf of Jodi Liggett, Arizona Foundation for Women. Ms. Bones said the Safety, Health and Economic Security for Women (S.H.E.) Counts! Women's Day at the Legislature was held on March 19, 2009. Ms. Bones said there were approximately 30 people in attendance. The event was a good start to a great collaboration. She said this is the first event that focuses solely on women and how budget cuts are impacting women disproportionately.

Update from the Arizona Coalition Against Domestic Violence

Ms. Bones said there is no update on the status of legislation. AzCADV has five priority bills in the Senate. However, none have gone through the hearing process. Ms. Bones said the Coalition participated in hearings on March 16, 2009, focused on policy issues related to domestic violence. The Coalition was asked to present on how domestic violence is funded in Arizona. She noted Pima and Maricopa County representatives talked about issues and barriers to prosecuting cases in those two jurisdictions.

Ms. Bones referenced the presentation given by Mr. Schmaltz regarding the current budget situation. She distributed an AzCADV FY2010 Budget Talking Points handout and stressed the need to act now. Ms. Bones noted a legislative update will be distributed soon announcing training dates for board members and community leaders. The training includes discussions on talking points, what the legislature needs to hear, and how to best relay those messages. Ms. Bones stressed the need to mobilize everyone to be part of the discussion.

9. Comments from the Council

Katie Hobbs said a performance is being given at the ASU Campus in Tempe titled *Dodging Bullets*. Ms. Hobbs said the powerful script was written by an ASU professor and is a one-person play. Performances are scheduled for April 10th, 11th, 17th and 18th.

Ms. Hobbs will be leading a discussion regarding domestic violence after the presentation on April 18, 2009. Additional information is available on FaceBook under *Dodging Bullets*. She noted the event is free but is first come, first serve.

Ms. Bones said “DV – The Musical” is being performed at the Herberger Theater on May 11, 2009 at 7:00 p.m. Tickets cost \$20 and are now available for purchase.

Ms. Tenney invited Committee members to attend the PSA Recognition Event at the Heard Museum on Monday, April 27, 2009 at 11:00 a.m. She said anyone attending the event will also receive free admission to the museum.

10. Adjourn

The meeting adjourned at 2:48 p.m. The next MAG Regional Domestic Violence Council meeting is scheduled for June 4, 2009, from 1:00-2:30 p.m. in the Saguaro Room at the MAG offices.